LOCAL SAFETY AUDIT GUIDE: TO PREVENT TRAFFICKING IN PERSONS AND RELATED EXPLOITATION

Research Report: 2013-1
Table of Contents

Part I: Trafficking in Persons –
Global and Canadian Context

1. Introduction ......................................................... 1

2. Trafficking in Persons and Related Exploitation – Global Context .......... 2
   Drawing on international developments in crime prevention to accelerate prevention
   of human trafficking ............................................ 3

3. Trafficking in Persons – Canadian Context .................................. 4
   Legal framework ..................................................... 4
   Nature and scope of trafficking in Canada ................................................. 4
   Victims ........................................................................ 5
   Who is trafficking – directly, enabling, using ............................................. 6
   Nature and scope of related exploitation .................................................... 7
   Canadian action and resources to prevent trafficking and other related exploitation .......................................... 10

Part II: Conducting a Sound Audit
and Developing an Action Plan ......................................................... 13

4. Preparatory stage – mobilizing energy and involvement ...................... 14
   Who needs to be involved – core team or steering group ......................... 14
   Who needs to be involved – key stakeholders forum .................................... 15
   Working in a participatory way ............................................................. 15
   Who will undertake the diagnostic and how long will it take ..................... 15
   Data collection, trust and confidentiality ................................................... 16

5. Stage 1: Broad city profile .................................................. 16
   Basic information on the city and catchment area ....................................... 16
   Economic and social issues .................................................................... 17
   Crime, disorder and victimization ............................................................. 17
   Trafficking and exploitation ................................................................... 17
   Assessing existing policies and services .................................................... 18

6. Stage 2: In-depth research on trafficking and related exploitation .......... 19
   Views of communities and key stakeholders ............................................. 19
   Strengths and gaps in existing policies and services .................................... 20
7. Stage 3: Identifying priorities, opportunities and prevention strategies
   Deciding on priorities
   Opportunities
   Developing a prevention action plan
   Preparing the safety audit report

8. Stage 4: Consulting and communicating

Part III: Specific populations at risk

9. Populations at risk of being trafficked and other related exploitation
   9.1 Aboriginal women and girls
   9.2 Children and youth at risk – trafficking and other related sexual exploitation
      Children and youth – violence in the family
      Children and youth growing up in care and leaving care
      Street/homeless children and youth
      Children and youth involved in gangs
      Technology and sexual exploitation
   9.3 Women at risk – trafficking for the purposes of sexual exploitation
      History of care, abuse or prior victimization
      Women involved in the sex industry
      Women who are homeless, in shelters and second stage housing
      Foreign students, recent immigrants, refugees, migrants
   9.4 Populations at risk – trafficking for the purposes of labour exploitation
      Foreign nationals – migrant workers, foreign visitors and students, persons without immigration status

10. Addressing demand

Annexes

Annex A: Glossary of Terms (alphabetical order)
Annex B: International laws and guidelines relevant to prevention of trafficking and other related exploitation
Annex C: Canadian examples of prevention practices
Part I: Trafficking in Persons – Global and Canadian Context

1. Introduction

This guide is designed to contribute to the development of strategic action plans to prevent human trafficking and other related forms of violence and exploitation in Canada’s urban centres, and to address the factors which make particular groups far more vulnerable to sexual exploitation and/or forced labour than others. It uses a sound evidence-based approach, and explicitly considers gender and other intersecting factors which influence an individual’s vulnerability. It will enable stakeholders from the public sector and civil society to assess the nature and extent of these problems in their particular urban area, and to develop an action plan tailored to those problems and their local context.

The need for unified action – in Canada and internationally – to prevent human trafficking, a modern form of slavery, which violates fundamental human rights, is clear. The Government of Canada’s National Action Plan (2012) seeks to accelerate action against trafficking in relation to prevention, prosecution, and protection of victims, and to foster partnerships which are vital to achieving progress in each of these areas.

Human trafficking is a complex crime which is facilitated by many factors, including the vulnerability of particular populations to exploitation, complicity or ignorance on the part of civil society, and the demand for particular goods and services. Human trafficking involves the recruitment, transportation, harbouring and/or exercising control, direction or influence over the movements of a person in order to exploit that person, typically through sexual exploitation or forced labour. Trafficking may occur entirely in one country or involve individuals being trafficked from other countries. It may involve illegal migrants who find themselves exploited once they arrive in Canada. It may involve people legitimately entering the country under foreign worker programs, but whose treatment and conditions of work amount to exploitation.

---

1 While this tool can be used by smaller northern and rural communities, a separate one is desirable given the unique issues facing these often remote communities.
2 Gender-Based Analysis (GBA) is a tool the federal government uses to assess the impacts of policies, programs or initiatives on diverse groups of women and men, girls and boys. GBA helps recognize and respond to the different situations and needs of the Canadian population. Gender is a major factor in GBA, but we must also take into consideration factors such as age, education, language, geography, culture and income. For more information, please visit http://www.swc-cfc.gc.ca/gba-acs/index-eng.html.
5 E.g. the Live-in Caregiver Programme and the Temporary Foreign Worker Programme.
The guide is of particular relevance to:

- Provincial, territorial and local government representatives and service providers responsible for and/or contributing to policies concerned with human trafficking and related exploitation;
- National organizations such as the Federation of Canadian Municipalities (FCM) and the Crime Prevention Committee of the Canadian Association of Chiefs of Police (CACP), given their leadership role in promoting community safety in general, and other national organizations mandated to address exploitation;
- National and local level non-government organizations concerned with human trafficking and related exploitation.

For Canadian cities which have already developed multi-partnership and comprehensive crime prevention strategies, this guide will help to complement their work by providing a more in-depth focus on human trafficking and other related exploitation. For those cities which have not yet established such an approach but are concerned about trafficking and related forms of exploitation, the guide can be used as a stand-alone tool.

This guide provides a brief review of the international norms and standards governing human trafficking and other related types of exploitation, as well as crime prevention, and of existing Canadian legislation and initiatives. It outlines the stages involved in developing a sound audit or diagnosis of the problems, and identifies who should be involved. It gives examples of the range of preventive approaches which can be used, from local regulations and public awareness-raising campaigns, to targeted awareness-raising and interventions with at-risk populations. The guide also includes a glossary of key terms and a list of international laws and instruments relevant to prevention of trafficking and other related forms of exploitation.

2. Trafficking in Persons and Related Exploitation – Global Context


Article 9 of the Trafficking Protocol provides strong support for prevention and requires States Parties to:

- establish comprehensive policies, programs and other measures to prevent trafficking;
- endeavour to undertake measures such as research, information and mass media campaigns and social and economic initiatives to prevent trafficking;
- include cooperation with non-governmental organizations and other elements of civil society in their (preventive) policies, programmes and other measures;
- take/strengthen measures to alleviate the factors that make persons, especially women and children, vulnerable to trafficking, such as poverty, underdevelopment and lack of equal opportunity;
- adopt or strengthen legislative or other measures (including educational, social or cultural) to discourage the demand that fosters all forms of exploitation, especially of women and children, that leads to trafficking.

---

6 See Annex A.
7 See Annex B.
Numerous other international norms and standards in relation to trafficking in persons, and to protecting vulnerable populations from other violence and exploitation, provide strong mandates for prevention.

Drawing on international developments in crime prevention to accelerate prevention of human trafficking

The most comprehensive guidance on how to develop prevention strategies and what kinds of action are involved comes from the *UN Guidelines on the Prevention of Crime* (2002). These and earlier ones on urban crime prevention are built upon years of practical experience and research. They emphasize the roles and responsibilities of governments at all levels to establish pro-active prevention strategies. Local services responsible, for example, for housing, health, job creation, recreation, education, and social services, can all have an impact upon the risks of people becoming victims or offenders. When these sectors work in partnership with the justice sector, using strategies which are based on good evidence and knowledge about crime problems and their causes, then crime and victimization can be effectively prevented.

The Guidelines set out eight basic principles for developing prevention strategies:

- all governments should play a leadership role in developing effective and humane crime prevention strategies and in creating and maintaining institutional frameworks for their implementation and review;
- crime prevention considerations should be integrated into all relevant social and economic policies and programs, including those addressing education, health, housing, urban planning, poverty, social marginalization and exclusion;
- cooperation and partnerships should be an integral part of effective crime prevention, including partnerships that work across ministries and between levels, community organizations, non-governmental organizations, the private sector and private citizens;
- prevention requires adequate resources to be sustained, and there should be clear accountability for funding, implementation, evaluation and achievement of planned results;
- Prevention strategies, policies and programs should be based on a broad, multi-disciplinary foundation of knowledge;
- Rule of law and human rights set out in instruments that countries are party to must be respected in all aspects of crime prevention;
- National crime prevention diagnoses and strategies should, where appropriate, take account of the links between local crime and international organized crime;
- Crime prevention strategies should pay due regard to the different needs of men and women, and consider the special needs of vulnerable members of society.

Four main approaches to crime prevention are outlined in the Guidelines, and these provide a wide range of options for developing action plans to prevent trafficking and related exploitation. The Guidelines also outline a systematic methodology or planning process for preventing crime of all kinds, which can be applied to the prevention of trafficking and related exploitation, especially at the local level. This entails

---

*See Annex B for a list of some of the other relevant international norms and standards and their preventive measures.*

*See also the UN Guidelines for Technical Assistance in the Field of Urban Crime Prevention (1995).*
a careful assessment of existing problems, their causes and resources using a safety audit. The audit is directed and undertaken by a core group of stakeholders, and aids the development of an action plan. The action plan itself will include: raising awareness about trafficking and exploitation, increasing regulation and inspection, and developing more targeted initiatives to protect those vulnerable to victimization and deter likely victimizers.

3. Trafficking in Persons – Canadian Context

Legal framework
The legal framework prohibits bringing persons into Canada by means such as deception, coercion, threat of force. The *Criminal Code* includes four specific indictable offences to address human trafficking, namely sections 279.01 (Trafficking in persons), 279.011 (Trafficking of a person under the age of eighteen years), 279.02 (Material benefit), and 279.03 (Withholding or destroying documents). The Code also defines exploitation for the purposes of trafficking: a person exploits another person if they cause the victim to provide labour or service for fear of their safety or the safety of someone known to them (s. 279.04). Additionally, many other *Criminal Code* offences can apply to human trafficking cases and can be used by police and Crown prosecutors depending on the facts and circumstances of a case. These include kidnapping, forcible confinement, uttering threats, extortion, assault, sexual assault, prostitution-related offences, and criminal organization offences.

Nature and scope of trafficking in Canada
Assessing the extent of human trafficking in Canada, as is the case internationally, is extremely difficult. Most cases are never reported to the police for a wide variety of reasons: the hidden nature of the offence; its links often to organized criminal activity; the reluctance of victims and witnesses to come forward and cooperate with police due to manipulation and threats from traffickers, fear, shame, language barriers, and/or mistrust of authorities; and the difficulty of identifying traffickers and victims in practice. In Canada, data on human trafficking is collected through a number of ways, including police reported incidents, convictions and the issuance of temporary resident permits for suspected trafficking victims.

Although the extent of human trafficking in Canada is difficult to determine, the following available statistics, as of April 2012, provide some context:

- 25 convictions (41 victims) under human trafficking specific offences in the Criminal Code enacted in 2005. This does not include the numerous other convictions for human trafficking related conduct under other criminal offences;
- Approximately 56 cases currently before the courts, involving at least 85 accused and 136 victims;
- At least 26 of these victims were under the age of 18 at the time of the alleged offence;
- Over 90% of these cases involve domestic human trafficking; the remaining, less than 10% involved people being brought into Canada from another country;
- 3 charges have been laid under section 118 of the *Immigration and Refugee Protection Act* (IRPA) which prohibits trafficking into Canada. While no convictions under that section have been registered, accused persons have been convicted under related provisions.
Victims
Women and girls represent the majority of the victims identified in this country as a whole to date. Victims may have been trafficked from other countries or within Canada itself. The latter include young women trafficked by pimps within a city and province, and inter-provincially as prostitutes, and young Aboriginal women trafficked from rural reserves to cities by gangs for sexual exploitation.10

In 2010, the Royal Canadian Mounted Police (RCMP) conducted a review of human trafficking cases reported to the police and intelligence agencies between 2005 and 2009.11 They concluded that the majority of recent trafficking convictions had involved victims who were citizens or permanent residents of Canada, often groomed and coerced into the sex trade by gangs. Some victims were underage girls exploited through dance clubs and escort services. Non-Canadian victims came from Asia, notably Thailand, Cambodia, Malaysia and Vietnam, as well as countries in Eastern Europe and Africa.

Intelligence on human trafficking of men and women for forced labour has come to light through investigations in Alberta, Ontario and British Columbia and Manitoba. Labour-related investigations have involved foreign nationals from China, Ethiopia, Hungary, India, Mexico, the Philippines, Poland and Thailand. In 2012, a Hungarian family network was successfully prosecuted for trafficking men from Hungary for the purposes of forced labour in the construction industry.12 Some fraudulent use of the Temporary Foreign Worker Program has also been evident, and the RCMP noted cases of foreign nationals smuggled into the country by employers, who were then controlled, threatened and forced to work as domestic helpers in poorly paid conditions.

Internationally, people living in disadvantaged situations with unemployment and poor job opportunities appear to be especially vulnerable to becoming tricked or persuaded that their lives will be better elsewhere. Similarly, in Canada one would expect that those groups most vulnerable to trafficking for sexual exploitation and forced labour include those who are socially or economically disadvantaged and marginalized:

- Poor and/or illegal migrant women and men;
- Seasonal migrant workers and domestic workers;
- Young Aboriginal women and girls;
- Young women and men coming out of the child protection system at 18 or from youth custody;
- Other at risk girls, boys and young women and men, for example those who have dropped out of school, become substance users, have mental health problems, have run away from home, or are in conflict with the law.

The RCMP Human Trafficking National Coordinating Centre notes, however, that more and more cases of girls and young women from a variety of backgrounds are being recruited by pimps in settings such as schools who are employing the false romance tactic.

11 Human Trafficking in Canada (2010). Ottawa: RCMP.
12 Globe and Mail, April 3rd and 4th 2012. Section A.
Who is trafficking – directly, enabling, using

Preventing trafficking in Canada requires consideration of who is directly involved in trafficking, including those who enable trafficking, providing tacit support to trafficking operations, and the users knowingly exploiting victims – those prepared to buy the services of the exploited, benefiting from cheap labour, failing to provide decent work conditions or pay, or seeking sexual services. All are offending.

The 2010 RCMP review found some limited intelligence in relation to organized criminal involvement in trafficking in cities with established Asian organized crime networks such as Vancouver. One of the challenges in proceeding with the cases involving Asian organized forced prostitution rings is obtaining the cooperation from the victims. In other cases, trafficking from other countries often involved groups of people, originally from the same countries, and loose criminal networks of illegitimate and legitimate contacts.13

Domestic trafficking appears to be more associated with pimps who may or may not have associations to street gangs. Recent reports suggest that some 300 street gangs have been identified across Canada. They tend to be associated with a city or area, and work at ‘the retail end’ of organized criminal activity on the street. They range from Aboriginal gangs in the Prairies to multi-ethnic urban gangs in Quebec and British Columbia.14 A separate RCMP review of domestic trafficking noted that victims were often recruited or lured into being trafficking by relatives or close friends, including especially among girls by those they consider their boyfriends.15

As part of their ongoing threat assessment on human trafficking, the RCMP found evidence of organized crime groups which included families being involved in trafficking for forced labour. In their 2010 report, the RCMP identified a number of illegal activities by agencies recruiting from abroad. The latter are private sector agencies referred to as Third Party Agencies, who undertake recruitment, placement and ‘labour leasing’ of foreign nationals for domestic, agricultural and other work. The successful prosecution of an Ontario case of trafficking for the purpose of forced labour of Hungarian construction workers involved a large criminal organization comprised of two family networks. (See Box)

---

Hungarian Family Trafficking Ring: As of June 1, 2012, seventeen members of an organized crime group involving two families in Hamilton, Ontario received sentences for participation in a criminal organization, conspiracy to commit trafficking in persons and/or fraud offences. The organization recruited men from their former village in Hungary promising steady work, good pay and better lives in Canada. On arrival, the men were forced to work long hours on construction sites operated by their traffickers for no pay, and claim welfare benefits which were then confiscated by their traffickers. They were under constant monitoring, threatened, living under poor conditions with some given only one meal a day.

13 Human Trafficking in Canada (2010). RCMP.
In trafficking cases, there are likely to be individuals and organizations which tacitly support trafficking operations by turning a blind eye to suspicious activities, failing to check references properly, or regularly inspecting and enforcing existing regulations. Hotels and their staff, apartment and housing owners and employees, and employers in shops, restaurants, farms, factories or industrial sites may be unknowingly facilitating trafficking and the exploitation of victims. Some individuals could be unknowing users of trafficking services including those who seek sexual services through patrolling downtown city centres and poor neighbourhoods, frequenting massage parlours, engaging escort agencies, and accessing sexual services through the Internet. These are three of the most important areas in which local and provincial/territorial authorities and services can institute preventive action.

There are various examples of pathways into trafficking and exploitation found in Canada. For instance:

- A sexually abused child may go into care or become a run-away, and this background may increase his/her chance of being enticed and exploited by a ‘john’ or a pimp;
- An aboriginal girl could be enticed from reserve to city due to lack of opportunity and become exploited by a pimp;
- A young migrant working as a dancer, whose employer retains her passport and controls her life, is at increased risk of being further exploited by the employer and customers;
- A migrant construction worker is lured under false promises by his prospective employer who then retains his passport and controls him by threats and force, thereby exploiting the worker.

The ‘supply’ of victims to human traffickers in Canada is clearly motivated by the profits to be made by the traffickers and the ease with which they are able to operate. It is also very clearly driven by continuing demand for the services of trafficked persons, and users’ general impunity from prosecution.

**Nature and scope of related exploitation**

> ‘...programmes designed to address only trafficking fall short in that they fail to recognize the broader context of the sexual exploitation in which the trafficking of Aboriginal girls takes place.’

Unlike the situation for trafficking, data on vulnerability and on other types of exploitation does exist in Canada but it may underestimate the extent of the problem given the hidden nature of most exploitation. This includes information on the sexual exploitation and abuse of children, including prostitution, child pornography, and the luring of children over the Internet. The Uniform Crime Reporting Survey collects some information on persons accused of crimes, and for violent crimes such as intimidation, information is also collected on victims. These data show that most victims of police-reported intimidation on the Internet, about 7 in 10 victims, were women or young girls. In cases of child luring, about 9 in 10 victims were girls.

---

Reporting of cases is affected by whether there is legislation against an activity, and public interest and concern about the problem. Child luring through the Internet, for example, became a specific offence in the Criminal Code in 2002, and the number of cases reported has increased yearly since that time.\(^\text{18}\)

Canada-wide data can also be difficult to find if an issue is a provincial and territorial responsibility. For example, child protection is a provincial/territorial responsibility and legislation and age ranges for protection vary between provinces, so estimating the number of children and youth in state care across the country is not straightforward, and methods of counting and estimation vary. Estimates of the size of groups especially vulnerable to exploitation include:\(^\text{19}\)

- Almost 9,000 cases of family sexual assault were reported in selected police areas in 2001, 81% involving girls, with the majority of victims between 7 and 14 years of age;\(^\text{20}\)
- Some 67,000 children and youth were estimated to be in ‘out-of-home’ care in 2007;\(^\text{21}\)
- Some 65,000 youth were estimated to be homeless/ living in homeless shelters in 2004;\(^\text{22}\)
- 464 cases of child luring through the Internet were reported between 2006 and 2007.\(^\text{23}\)

The sexual exploitation of girls and boys, young women and young men is highly damaging for the victims, and makes them especially vulnerable to further exploitation, including through human trafficking. There are other risk factors that contribute to this vulnerability, ranging from broad social ones to community, family and individual ones. The ecological model assists in examining these risk factors.

---

**World Health Organization – Ecological model for understanding violence**

[Diagram of the ecological model]

The *World Report on Violence and Health*\(^\text{24}\) uses an ecological model for understanding the complex and multi-faceted nature of violence. This model examines factors at the individual, relationship, community and societal levels that influence behaviour and increase the risk of committing or being a victim of

---


\(^\text{19}\) More detailed information on at risk groups can be found in Part III.

\(^\text{20}\) *Sexual Abuse and Exploitation of Children and Youth: A Fact Sheet from the Department of Justice, Canada* (2005); and *Family Violence in Canada: A Statistical Profile* (2004). Cat. No. 85-224-XIE.


\(^\text{22}\) Raising the Roof (2009). *Youth Homelessness in Canada: The Road to Solutions*. www.raisingtheroof.org


violence. This model demonstrates the inter-relationship between the levels so that factors in one level can be strengthened or modified by factors in another level. The following extracts from this Report capture the key factors in each level:

The first level identifies biological and personal history factors that influence how individuals behave and increase their likelihood of becoming a victim or perpetrator of violence. Examples of factors that can be measured or traced include demographic characteristics (age, education, income), psychological or personality disorders, substance abuse and a history of behaving aggressively or experiencing abuse.

The second level looks at close relationships such as those with family, friends, intimate partners and peers, and explores how these relationships increase the risk of being a victim or perpetrator of violence level…

The third level explores the community contexts in which social relationships occur such as schools, workplaces and neighborhoods, and seeks to identify the characteristics of these settings that increase the risk for violence. Risk at this level may be influenced by factors such as residential mobility…

The fourth level looks at the broad societal factors that help create a climate in which violence is encouraged or inhibited. These include the availability of weapons and social and cultural norms…

Aboriginal peoples represent the population most vulnerable to exploitation in Canada. Aboriginal peoples have endured racism, discrimination and violence for centuries. Colonization and state policies including residential schools and high placement rates in the child welfare system, have eroded traditional Aboriginal culture and language, and are underlying factors for rates of violence and substance abuse in many Aboriginal families and communities.26

Recent studies of Aboriginal girls and women in Canada underline not only their overrepresentation in child welfare systems, but their sexual exploitation including through the visible sex trade and domestic trafficking.27

It was suggested that reframing some of the exploitative acts that are perpetrated against Aboriginal women as “trafficking” may serve to undermine the stereotypes that have long been attached to them such as “prostitute” and “criminal”… Overall, a shift is required away from interpreting legislation in the light of preconceived notions of what trafficking “victims” look like, and a move towards protecting vulnerable people in dire economic circumstances from having their labour exploited.\textsuperscript{28} This reframing is being undertaken more broadly within law enforcement to encourage consideration of someone being a victim of trafficking, rather than assuming that a person is freely engaging in prostitution.

Canadian action and resources to prevent trafficking and other related exploitation

National Action

The Government of Canada launched its National Action Plan to Combat Human Trafficking in June 2012. A Human Trafficking Taskforce, led by Public Safety Canada and comprised of key departments, will replace the Interdepartmental Working Group on Trafficking in Persons and be responsible for overseeing the implementation of the National Action Plan commitments under the 4-Ps, coordinating the federal anti-human trafficking response, and reporting annually on progress to the public. The National Action Plan, in relation to prevention, recognizes the following:

- the importance of developing holistic strategies that address the risk factors that can lead to human trafficking and related forms of exploitation, and that will assist in reducing victimization and associated harms;
- the need for successful prevention strategies to be developed and implemented at all stages of the prevention continuum from awareness raising through to prevention of re-victimization;
- a need to enhance awareness activities that are tailored to specific audiences;
- a need to assist communities to identify people and places most at risk of human trafficking so that prevention and intervention can be better targeted.

The Government of Canada will increase its prevention and awareness efforts in several ways, including by:

- Developing a new and enhanced web page that includes updates on the Government of Canada’s efforts, resources, awareness materials and events;
- Aligning national education, information and awareness campaigns and developing campaigns tailored for specific audiences which include a “TruckSTOP” campaign to prevent human trafficking for the purpose of sexual exploitation, distribution of the RCMP “I’m Not for Sale” campaign including to large communities of First Nations, Inuit and Métis; a youth campaign; and distribution of awareness materials at Canadian Embassies and Consulates;
- Enhancing understanding of exploitation of Aboriginal girls and boys, women and men, with a focus on prevention and providing culturally and historically informed training to enforcement officials on the circumstances that may contribute to human trafficking within Aboriginal communities;
- Developing awareness products for temporary foreign workers, employers and third parties, and updating in foreign languages a brochure informing temporary foreign workers and international students who may work in Canada of their rights and providing important contact information;

Developing national and local diagnostic tools to assist with the identification of populations and places most at-risk of trafficking and other related forms of exploitation in Canada. In addition, these tools will identify the range of prevention practices that should be considered.


The Human Trafficking National Coordinating Centre (HTNCC), established by the RCMP in 2005, acts as a national focal point for all law enforcement in their efforts to combat human trafficking. It undertakes analysis, and conducts awareness-raising and training, among other activities. It works closely with federal, provincial and territorial agencies as well as internationally. Among other initiatives, the Centre has developed a training curriculum on human trafficking for front-line and other workers.

In 2011, Public Safety supported four roundtables to look at existing prevention action, and discuss what a national framework for human trafficking prevention might look like. Provincial roundtables took place in Vancouver and Winnipeg, with the national and international meetings in Montreal. Key substantive findings emerging from these meetings are that a trafficking prevention strategy or action plan should be based on the principles and methodology of the United Nations Guidelines for the Prevention of Crime, and should:

- Extend beyond the narrow legal definition of trafficking and address a range of behaviours associated with sexual and labour exploitation;
- Be governed by international treaty obligations, norms and standards in relation to trafficking in persons, and to exploitation of specific vulnerable populations such as children, women and minorities;
- Be concerned with domestic and international trafficking activities;
- Focus on both the supply of victims and the demand for their services;
- Build on existing structures as far as possible;
- Develop a good evidence base and knowledge about effective practices.

**Provincial and territorial initiatives**

British Colombia’s Office to Combat Trafficking in Persons (OCTIP) was established in 2007. It works with the federal government, provincial ministries, law enforcement, academic organizations and community agencies to:

- build services for trafficked persons, including shelter, health care, counselling and support services, legal consultation and interpretation services;
- coordinate the development and implementation of awareness and training activities for front line workers, service providers, legal professionals and anyone who is likely to encounter trafficked persons;
- partner with law enforcement to ensure that services for trafficking in persons are accessed as required;
- maintain an updated website, listing research, resources, and community services available.

In 2011, in partnership with Public Safety Canada and the Department of Justice, OCTIP launched an on-line self-guided training curriculum on human trafficking designed for service providers and practitioners. It includes modules on understanding what trafficking is, recognizing when it is taking place, knowing how to help victims, and where to refer them.

---

30 [www.pssg.gov.bc.ca/octip](http://www.pssg.gov.bc.ca/octip)
Manitoba is very active in relation to trafficking for purposes of sexual and labour exploitation. It passed the \textit{Worker Recruitment and Protection Act} in 2009 to protect migrant workers from exploitation and trafficking. It has a number of provincial initiatives on human trafficking and sexual exploitation which bring together government and civil society organizations, including the \textit{Tracia’s Trust Provincial Task Force}, an interdepartmental committee on trafficking, a \textit{Sexual Exploitation Unit} and regional sexual exploitation teams, a \textit{Trafficking in Persons Response Team}, and a First Nations Working Group on sexual exploitation and trafficking. This province is currently developing a Code of Conduct in partnership with the business sector on exploitation prevention.\textsuperscript{31}

In Alberta, the \textit{Action Coalition on Human Trafficking} (ACT Alberta) is a coalition of government agencies, NGO’s and other stakeholders including survivors of trafficking. It undertakes a number of actions from public awareness to training for service providers.\textsuperscript{32}

A number of other provinces and territories have committees\textsuperscript{33}, working groups or designated personnel who are concerned with trafficking and exploitation issues and migrant workers. They provide some support services for trafficking victims or those at risk, and have conducted awareness-raising campaigns against trafficking. They are variously located in departments of social and family service, Aboriginal affairs, justice, public safety, labour or the police. Annex C provides further information on provincial and territorial initiatives.

\textbf{Local government initiatives}

A number of municipalities such as Montreal, Edmonton and Halifax have set up task forces or multidisciplinary teams which bring together representatives of local government, the police, social and family services, housing and educational sectors, for example, on issues including youth gangs, neighbourhood violence and trafficking. The organization \textit{Safedmonton}, for example, set up a working group which reported on ‘Working together to Address Sexual Exploitation in Edmonton’ in 2007. The City of Montreal developed an Action Plan on street prostitution from 2004-7. These cities are also members of the Municipal Network on Crime Prevention which acts as a forum for sharing crime prevention knowledge and experience.\textsuperscript{34}

The Municipal Network includes fourteen Canadian cities which exchange experience about crime prevention problems, initiatives and programmes. The network was established and is coordinated by the Institute for the Prevention of Crime (IPC) at the University of Ottawa. IPC has published a number of reports on their work, including a tool \textit{Making Cities Safer: Action Briefs for Municipal Stakeholders} (2009), which draws on the \textit{UN Guidelines on the Prevention of Crime}.\textsuperscript{35}

Multi-agency partnerships between governments, the police and national, provincial and local non-government organizations are crucial to advance effective prevention. They include organizations such

\begin{flushleft}
\textsuperscript{31} Eg. \textit{Tracia’s Trust Manitoba Sexual Exploitation Strategy} www.manitoba.ca/fs/traciastrust
\end{flushleft}
as PACT Ottawa, and the Salvation Army which focus on trafficking and related exploitation. Their work often includes information gathering and developing support services for trafficking victims. Apart from training curricula, both governments and non-government organizations have developed tools and guides on human trafficking to raise awareness or provide information to potential or actual victims. For example, the People’s Law School in Vancouver published a brief guide to *Human Trafficking in Canada* in 2010. Annex C provides further information on some of these organizations and resources.

Thus while federal and provincial or territorial governments have a major role to play in developing and supporting prevention action, it is local governments which are most likely to be faced with the consequences of trafficking and exploitation, and where users are active. Attention to local regulations, inspections, and service provision, alerting the business and private sector, local citizens groups, and the population to the possibilities of trafficking activity, increasing public awareness, and undertaking training of key personnel are all important activities which local authorities can undertake.

**Part II: Conducting a Sound Audit and Developing an Action Plan**

This section focuses on how to undertake a local diagnosis or audit\(^{36}\) and develop proposals for a prevention action plan at the local level. It draws in part on the *Guidance on Local Safety Audits: A Compendium on International Practice*.\(^{37}\) More detailed explanation of the stages of the process and technical information on how to undertake surveys and interviews etc. can be found in that publication.

**The purpose of the local safety audit is:**

To build as comprehensive a picture as possible of the current problems of crime and insecurity in a municipality or neighbourhood – in this case trafficking and other exploitation – and the causes of those problems, including how these vary across gender and diversity.

To develop a local action plan that responds to those problems and their causes. This will include deciding on the priorities, building on policies and services already in place and creating new partnerships and initiatives.

By collecting qualitative and quantitative information which is gender and diversity disaggregated from a wide range of sources such as community organizations, women’s groups, housing and recreation departments, and social, family and health services, rather than relying just on police reported data or intelligence, a comprehensive picture will emerge of who is involved, where the problems are taking place, and what facilitates them.

\(^{36}\)The terms safety audit and safety diagnosis are often used interchangeably, and refer to the same process of systematic assessment of problems concerning community safety and crime prevention.

\(^{37}\)This is a safety audit tool published by the European Forum for Urban Safety in 2008, with support from the Government of Canada (Public Safety Canada), which brings together expertise and knowledge about conducting safety audits from many parts of the world.
Some of the information needed for the safety audit may already exist in routine municipal and police reports and data collected by local services or organizations. In other cases it may be necessary to undertake specific surveys or reviews. The views and experiences of community and business organizations, non-governmental organizations (NGOs) working in the field, and service providers from municipal, provincial and federal governments, will be essential to help build a full picture, as well as people who have themselves been involved in trafficking and exploitation.

The Guidance on Local Safety Audits identifies four stages in the process of conducting a safety audit which are shown in the diagram below. These are preceded by a mobilization or preparatory stage which involves bringing together the core team responsible for conducting the audit and identifying the key stakeholders who need to be consulted and involved.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The Stages of Conducting a Local Safety Audit</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Preparatory</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bringing together key players</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Create audit team and determine communities to be engaged</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Gender and diversity considerations are a cross-cutting lens and need to be incorporated at every stage.

4. **Preparatory stage – mobilizing energy and involvement**

Who needs to be involved – core team or steering group

The final action plan will form part of the city or municipality’s crime prevention policy – so it needs input and buy-in from key players from the start to ensure that it is implemented and followed through. It needs to have the authority and resources to undertake its work. The core team or steering group needs to include senior figures such as the mayor, the chief executive of the local government and the chief of police or senior representatives of those offices. Other core team members should include representatives from relevant government, non-governmental, community based and private sector organizations – women’s organizations, child protection, youth and family services, Aboriginal services, health, education, labour and housing, – in other words those services working directly with potential victims of trafficking and related exploitation. In some cases it may be important to include provincial or territorial representatives where services are not administered by the local government.

Who needs to be involved – key stakeholders forum

The core team will need to work actively with a range of other stakeholders, and together they form the stakeholders’ roundtable or forum on trafficking and related exploitation. They may include representatives of immigrant groups and other minorities, local labour organizations, health services, immigration services, hotel associations, job-placement centres, chambers of commerce, police, other local, provincial
or national organizations providing services to victims or potential victims of trafficking, as well as the media. It is also very useful to include local researchers or academics with expertise in the area of trafficking and exploitation where possible.

**Working in a participatory way**

Cities are made up of a rainbow of different groups and populations. The stakeholder forum cannot include representatives of all of them. So it is very important for the safety audit to enable the many sectors in the city with different backgrounds, views and experiences to have an active role and voice.

**Who will undertake the diagnostic and how long will it take**

Initial decisions will need to be agreed by the core team in terms of who will undertake the day-to-day work, and what the time scale will be. There should be a member of the team tasked with overseeing the details. The time to conduct the diagnostic and develop the action plan will depend in part on the size of the city and its capacity for prevention, and could take 6 to 12 months. It should be noted, however, that action can be taken before then. If a problem is clearly identified early on, it may be agreed to take action and gain a ‘quick win’ which helps to build confidence.

It is worth noting that conducting a good safety audit requires a range of technical skills which are valuable for pulling together existing information and data, collecting and analysing additional data, and presenting clear and well informed reports. The *Guidance on Local Safety Audits* lists some of these skills.\(^3^8\)

- **Research design** – formulation of objectives, selection of methods, specification of outputs;
- **Project management** – scheduling of work, allocation of resources, risk management and quality assurance;
- **Stakeholder analysis** – identification of all stakeholders, assessment of their stake and determining how they should be involved;
- **Community engagement** – use of activities that encourage broad participation, especially to facilitate the engagement of women, youth and ‘hard-to-reach’ groups;
- **Consultative techniques** – interviews, meetings and focus groups to elicit information from service providers and community interests;
- **Victimization surveys** – questionnaire design, population sampling, database construction and interrogation;
- **Gender-Based Analysis** – identification of gender and diversity considerations throughout the audit;\(^3^9\)
- **Statistical analysis** – identifying, collecting and analysing relevant data held by agencies, possibly using geographical information systems; and
- **Communication** – report writing, giving presentations and other activities to keep stakeholders involved and to get feedback from research findings.

---


\(^{39}\) Status of Women Canada (SWC) has a gender-based analysis research guide about integrating both gender and other variables (http://www.swc-cfc.gc.ca/gba-acs/guide-eng.html) and a checklist (http://www.swc-cfc.gc.ca/gba-acs/list-aide-eng.html) with other resources at http://www.swc-cfc.gc.ca/gba-acs/resources-ressources-eng.html.
Data collection, trust and confidentiality

The first two stages of the audit process involve collecting gender disaggregated and diversity–disaggregated qualitative and quantitative data. A variety of different sources and methods can be used:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Documents</th>
<th>Reports and studies – government, NGO, academic, media</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Statistics</td>
<td>Local, provincial/territorial, national, public agencies, police, civil society, business</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interviews</td>
<td>Key informants and stakeholders, organizations providing services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Surveys</td>
<td>Opinion polls, household or street surveys, surveys of victims, commercial establishments, local neighbourhoods, schools</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consultations</td>
<td>Focus groups and meetings with local communities, associations, the media, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outreach</td>
<td>Meetings with individuals or groups in their own settings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Observation</td>
<td>Visiting specific locations to observe activities, talk with locals, undertake exploratory walks</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

5. Stage 1: Broad city profile

The first stage of a local audit involves building a broad picture of the city and its catchment area, and the extent of social and economic problems, and trafficking and related exploitation. Information needs to be collected and pooled from readily available sources. It should be disaggregated as far as possible – broken down in terms of age, gender and ethno-cultural background, as well as the intersection of these – and in terms of its distribution across city sectors or neighbourhoods. In some cities there may be existing geo-coded information which maps the location of demographic, economic and social information. The chart below indicates the main types of information to be collected.

Basic information on the city and catchment area

- Population (city and catchment area)
- Age and Gender structure including intersectional analysis
- Ethno-cultural diversity – countries of origin, language and length of time in city
- Immigration and Migration (within Canada and from outside)

Economic and social issues

- Main economic activities, industries (and migrant or temporary workers)
- Socio-economic profile of the population
  - Unemployment levels
  - Poor housing and infrastructure
  - Education levels – school drop-out
  - Health problems
  - Family violence and child abuse
  - Drug and alcohol problems
- Children in/exiting the child protection system
- Homelessness
Crime, disorder and victimization

- Reported crime rates and types
- Neighbourhoods with high levels of crime and victimization
- Main places/locations of drug and sex trade and youth gang activity
- Perceptions of risk, vulnerability, police and other services

 Trafficking and exploitation

- What is known about the nature and scope of trafficking for purposes of sexual exploitation in your city?
- What is the profile of known victims of trafficking (gender, age, ethnicity, origin, and nature of their exploitation)?
- What is known about the method of ‘recruitment’ of victims in relation to trafficking for sexual exploitation? How do these methods differ for different populations?
- How many local cases of actual or suspected human trafficking have there been in recent years?
- Who are the traffickers (gender, age, ethnicity, origin, links to youth gangs, pimping or organized crime)?
- Where in the city and catchment area are trafficking and exploitation or recruitment most likely to be occurring?
  - Transport hubs
  - International border areas close to city
  - Commerce/industries (strip bars, beauty/ massage/ escort services, malls, food processing, restaurants, farms, mining and lumber industries)
  - Private homes
  - Remote and rural areas
  - Schools, group homes
  - Hotels
  - Entertainment or tourist districts
- What general information is there about Internet luring locally?

Assessing existing policies and services

- Are there any specific policies or initiatives relating to trafficking or related exploitation in the city or province/territory (e.g., provincial legislation; local task force on sexual exploitation; public awareness campaigns about trafficking; hotlines to report incidents or get help; codes of conduct for local businesses; regulations and inspections affecting the local hotel, bars, industry and agricultural sectors)?
- What public and private organizations provide services to those at risk of trafficking and exploitation, or to the victims (e.g., legal services, information and advice; support and shelter; health services; services for at risk youth)?
- Have law enforcement agencies and service providers, including healthcare workers and workplace safety inspectors, received any training in identifying and supporting trafficked victims (e.g., general awareness or more in-depth training)?
- What policies or practices are barriers to preventing trafficking and related exploitation?
The main sources of information are government and civil society:

**Government**
- Municipal records and reports
- Local police reported crime and intelligence, provincial police reports, Statistics Canada Uniform Crime Reports (other law enforcement agencies, border control, customs and immigration, CISC)
- Criminal justice agencies (victims services, corrections, courts)
- Health services, clinics, hospitals especially those providing services to sex workers and hospital emergency departments
- Family welfare and child protection services
- Aboriginal services
- Labour departments and inspectorates
- General Household Survey, Statistics Canada on victimization rates and fear of crime

**Civil society sources**
- Chamber of Commerce, business sector
- Aboriginal organizations
- Community groups representing national, ethnic or cultural groups, including immigrant women’s groups
- Organizations providing legal services, support to legal and illegal immigrants, asylum seekers or sex workers
- Women’s advocacy groups, victim services and victim/witness assistance programmes, women’s shelters, sexual assault crisis centres etc.
- Faith-based and other NGO’s providing support/services relating to exploitation
- Academic reports and studies
- Organized labour groups such as unions and local labour councils

6. **Stage 2: In-depth research on trafficking and related exploitation**

Much of the activity associated with trafficking and related forms of exploitation – gang activity, pimping, child exploitation – is hidden and unreported. The second stage of the safety audit process, therefore, involves collecting in-depth information on the groups most at risk of sexual exploitation and those who are trafficking in the local area, the views of communities and key stakeholders, and the strengths and gaps in existing policies and services.

A variety of research methods can be used to gain more detailed information:

- undertaking specific local surveys of residents, businesses, commercial areas and service providers on their experiences and views;
- conducting more detailed interviews with key informants on causal factors, gaps in policies and services;
- holding consultations with community groups, women’s organizations, immigrant organizations;
- doing outreach work with experiential women and others in the sex industry;
- observing activities and locations.
It may be useful to set up working groups to investigate different topics, or commission local organizations or researchers to undertake surveys and interviews, but always in close association with the Project Coordinator and Core Team. The *Guidance on Local Safety Audits* provides some useful technical information on how to conduct surveys, undertake consultations and gather qualitative information. More detailed gender-disaggregated information should also be sought at this stage on the exploiters, the exploited and on conditions of work, hours, salaries etc.

**Views of communities and key stakeholders**

Surveys and interviews should also be used to find out the views, experience and knowledge of local communities or sectors affected by trafficking. How much are the public in those communities aware of trafficking and related forms of exploitation in the city? How much are industries and the business and commercial sector aware of the problems, and the important prevention role they can play? What are the views of children coming out of care? What are the views of those already involved in trafficking and exploitation?

**Strengths and gaps in existing policies and services**

Similarly, interviews and surveys can help to identify gaps and strengths in existing services and policies. What solutions do local stakeholders suggest? What do local NGO’s think about current policies? What else needs to be put in place? What do those already involved in trafficking think would help prevent others from becoming exploited or trafficked? What training needs do different sectors have? What barriers exist in policies and programs to prevent exploitation or remove individuals from exploitative situations?

It is important to try to balance the views of service providers with those of service users, those in need of services, as well as independent experts or researchers.

7. **Stage 3: Identifying priorities, opportunities and prevention strategies**

**Deciding on priorities**

Having undertaken more detailed research and analysis, the safety audit team will be in a better position to draw conclusions about what can be done to target the problems identified, what the priorities are, and what additional policies and interventions are needed. This may not be easy, since stakeholders may disagree about which are the most serious problems, and which should be tackled first.

---

40 See Guidance on Local Safety Audits op. cit. Part C.
It is important to agree on a time scale for action – with short term, medium and longer term plans. This allows for some quick results or ‘quick wins’ which will demonstrate progress. In order to decide on priorities it helps to establish some explicit criteria which the core team and stakeholder forum can agree on, such as:

- What are the main concerns of local communities?
- Which problems would contribute most to wider policy priorities?
- What kinds of resources are available (financial, technical, human)?
- Which risk factors need to be addressed most urgently?
- Which population groups are most vulnerable and at greatest risk?
- Which neighbourhoods and commercial areas are most affected by trafficking and exploitation?
- Which types of trafficking/exploitation have the greatest volume and incidence rate?
- Which types of trafficking/exploitation show the highest rate of increase?
- Are there any short-term actions which can be taken?

Opportunities
It is important to consider all the assets, strengths and opportunities which the safety audit process has uncovered so far. This will help in the development and implementation of the final action plan itself. These may include:

- Strong communities or interest groups that want – and have the capacity – to play a significant role in bringing about change;
- Successful projects and programmes run by NGO’s and other civil society organizations, or government services such as police and crime prevention which could be extended to deliver more preventive services;
- Agencies which recognise the links between what they do and the prevention of trafficking and exploitation, and are keen to make a contribution;
- Government policies and legislation that can be used to tackle trafficking and exploitation problems;
- Funding programmes that offer resources for activities focussed on these priorities;
- Existing tools that could be utilized for various preventative initiatives.

Developing a prevention action plan
The research and analysis will have identified gaps in services and options for new policies to be identified. Additional research on good practice examples in Canada and other countries may be valuable at this stage.

The Core Team and Stakeholder Forum should discuss what a comprehensive prevention strategy on trafficking and exploitation should look like. The chart below outlines the prevention approaches which could be used including legislation, establishment of a permanent forum, general and targeted awareness-raising and specific interventions. Please see Annex C for Canadian examples.
### Continuum of prevention options for trafficking and related exploitation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Practice</th>
<th>Sexual Exploitation</th>
<th>Labour Exploitation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Legislation</strong></td>
<td>Provincial legislation</td>
<td>Inspection of work places</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Governance</strong></td>
<td>Establish permanent local task force or forum; mechanisms to coordinate information and action</td>
<td>Regulation of bars, massage, body rub, beauty salons etc. Regular inspection and enforcement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Local regulation and enforcement</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Local/provincial/territorial protocols</td>
<td>E.g. Protocols between police/municipality and social services; with business sector; NGO’s etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Situational Prevention</strong></td>
<td>Patrolling and surveillance of hot spots</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>General Awareness Raising</strong></td>
<td>Public education and awareness raising</td>
<td>Local media, posters, leaflets</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>User awareness campaigns</td>
<td>Who are the users, what are the impacts of demand</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Hotlines and public numbers for reporting, advice and help</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Media awareness raising</td>
<td>Information sessions with provincial and local media</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Internet awareness</td>
<td>With parents, schools, youth groups</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Targeted Awareness Raising</strong></td>
<td>Education and awareness raising</td>
<td>Schools, youth clubs, Aboriginal families/communities, foster parent groups</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Community and Neighbourhood Prevention</strong></td>
<td>Local campaigns</td>
<td>Inclusive projects which support at risk populations, invite discussions with business sector, alert residents to how they can help</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Projects to provide support and services</td>
<td>Drop-in centres, outreach work, education and skills training; supported housing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Interventions</strong></td>
<td>Interventions with high risk groups, reintegration for post care or custody groups</td>
<td>Children in care, coming out of care; Street children; youth gangs; women in disadvantaged circumstances (drug, alcohol use, homeless, working in sex trade etc.)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Reaching a consensus among all the members of the Core Team and Stakeholder Forum on the priorities and time scale and possible interventions is very important since this will affect how the audit results are communicated and implemented in the future.
Preparing the safety audit report

Work on the preparation of the report of the safety audit and its findings and recommendations should be completed at this stage. The final written report needs to be based on an analysis of all the gender-disaggregated qualitative and quantitative data collected, and recommendations about programmes and interventions. It will be the result of detailed discussion by the core team and stakeholder forum. It needs to outline their vision and objectives, and place the issues of trafficking and exploitation in the city in the context of provincial/territorial and national trends as far as possible. It should set out the priorities and possibilities for developing a workable prevention action plan. A summary of the key findings will also be needed, and possibly translated into relevant languages. The table below illustrates the main areas of information which the audit report should aim to cover. 41

| Introduction | Vision and objectives  
| Core Steering Group and Stakeholder Forum  
| Research methods and team  
| Consultations on the report, including key questions |
| Summary of Key Findings | Main problems and concerns  
| Current preventive activity, including services and projects  
| Available resources, strengths and capacities |
| Description of the City | Socio-economic profile of the population  
| Physical and economic environment  
| Future development: significant trends |
| Profile of trafficking and related exploitation in the city | Findings of data gathering and analysis:  
| • nature, scale, trends and distribution of trafficking and exploitation in the city  
| • risk/causal factors identified  
| • impacts, including social consequences  
| • victim/target and offender profiles  
| • users  
| • gender and diversity profiles for all of the above |
| Current Responses | Relevant legislation and institutions  
| Policies and services addressing risk factors  
| Prevention activities  
| What is and isn't working well  
| Lessons learned and opportunities for development |
| Recommendations | Emerging priorities based on the evidence gathered  
| Key partners for future action  
| Resources and capacities |
| Future Action | Next steps: action planning  
| Timeframes  
| Leadership – who is responsible for what? |

41 Based on 'Safety Audit Report Template' developed by CSIR South Africa, reproduced in the *Guidance on Local Safety Audits*, p. 28.
8. **Stage 4: Consulting and communicating**

The final stage of the safety audit process involves sharing and disseminating the report widely to get feedback from stakeholders and the public, including meetings with elected representatives, neighbourhood associations, youth groups, women’s organizations, Aboriginal organizations, ethnocultural and immigrant associations, social service providers, the Chamber of Commerce and hotel associations. A media strategy is required when the report is made public, and a gender-based analysis of the strategy will help determine how best to reach diverse stakeholders. The table below, taken from the *Guidance on Safety Audits*, illustrates the different levels of community engagement which are possible.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Stage</th>
<th>Informing</th>
<th>Consulting</th>
<th>Involving</th>
<th>Collaborating</th>
<th>Empowering</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Planning</td>
<td>Community informed by newsletters and media of audit plan</td>
<td>Civil society representatives submit inputs or comment on plans</td>
<td>Communities involved in the planning process</td>
<td>Community representatives are members of the planning group</td>
<td>Community representatives chair the Steering Group and agree on plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stage 1: Wide and Shallow</td>
<td>Community informed by newsletters and media coverage of key statistics</td>
<td>Interviews with citywide civil society, written submissions, surveys</td>
<td>Interaction with communities to discuss issues and explore viewpoints</td>
<td>Communities actively involved in audit team</td>
<td>Community representatives decide which issues to study in Stage 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stage 2: Narrow and Deep</td>
<td>Community informed by newsletters, media coverage of detailed studies</td>
<td>Meetings with community groups, consultations, surveys</td>
<td>Joint workshops to exchange ideas and discuss conclusions</td>
<td>Communities leading audit work in certain areas</td>
<td>Communities take lead in assessing significance of data collected</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stage 3: Priorities and Opportunities</td>
<td>Community informed by newsletters, media coverage of emerging results</td>
<td>Comments on the analysed data and emerging priorities</td>
<td>Communities involved in prioritisation and assessing assets</td>
<td>Communities strongly influence selection of priorities</td>
<td>Communities decide priorities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stage 4: Consulting and Communicating</td>
<td>Distribution of audit report with media coverage</td>
<td>Invited community feedback on audit report</td>
<td>Discussion of draft report before publication</td>
<td>Audit report written collaboratively and circulated for comment</td>
<td>Community representatives decide content of final report</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Gender and diversity are cross-cutting lenses to be incorporated at every stage.

---

Part III: Specific populations at risk

9. Populations at risk of being trafficked and other related exploitation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Individual</th>
<th>Family</th>
<th>School</th>
<th>Community</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Growing up in care</td>
<td>• Violence/abuse</td>
<td>• Truancy</td>
<td>• Disadvantage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Hyperactivity</td>
<td>• Lack of affection</td>
<td>• Suspension/expulsion</td>
<td>• High crime rate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Impulsivity</td>
<td>• Poor supervision</td>
<td>• School failure</td>
<td>• Racial tension</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Learning difficulties</td>
<td>• Inconsistent discipline</td>
<td>• Aggressive behaviour</td>
<td>• Unemployment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Mental Illness</td>
<td>• Family breakdown</td>
<td>• Bullying</td>
<td>• Disorganization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Insecurity</td>
<td>• Mental illness</td>
<td>• Lack of commitment</td>
<td>• Neglect</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Poor social skills</td>
<td>• Parental conflict</td>
<td>• Poor relationships</td>
<td>• Availability of drugs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Low self esteem</td>
<td>• Poverty</td>
<td>• Special needs</td>
<td>• High turnover</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Drug use</td>
<td>• Substance abuse</td>
<td>• Unsupportive parents</td>
<td>• Lack of attachment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Anti-social friends</td>
<td>• Criminality</td>
<td>• Under achievement</td>
<td>• Poor living conditions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Friends who offend</td>
<td>• Unemployment</td>
<td>• Peer rejection</td>
<td>• Lack of services</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The populations at greatest risk of trafficking and related forms of exploitation in Canada are those who are exposed to a number of overlapping risk factors in their lives at the individual, family, school, community and societal levels. They are likely to be among the poorest and more disadvantaged groups. Children, adolescent girls and women tend to be most at risk of sexual trafficking and exploitation, while both men and women are at risk of labour exploitation. There are strong links between being exposed to risk factors in childhood and adolescence and their continuing influence on adult life. The table below provides a more detailed list of some of the risk factors affecting girls and boys and young women and young men, noting that they are often affected in different ways.43

9.1 Aboriginal women and girls

In 2010, the Native Women’s Association of Canada (NWAC) reported that to date 582 Aboriginal women and girls had been murdered or are missing. This number continues to increase every year.44

Aboriginal peoples represent one of the most vulnerable populations in Canada. Given the systemic conditions of disadvantage and poverty in which many rural and remote Aboriginal communities live, their exposure to risk factors is often much greater than among non-Aboriginal populations, and thus their risk of exploitation much higher. The Native Women’s Association of Canada have argued that violence, substance abuse and sexual exploitation have become normalized within some Aboriginal communities and that there is little discussion on the topic.45

---

45 Ibid.
The 2007 Report of the *Standing Committee on the Status of Women* noted that Aboriginal girls and women are at greatest risk of becoming victims of trafficking and exploitation in Canada. Some 40% of them live in poverty, more than half those over the age of 15 are unemployed, and more than half of Aboriginal single-parent households require core housing.\textsuperscript{46}

\begin{quote}
‘…programmes designed to address only trafficking fall short in that they fail to recognize the broader context of the sexual exploitation in which the trafficking of Aboriginal girls takes place.’\textsuperscript{47}
\end{quote}

While this toolkit is mainly concerned with assessing problems in relation to human trafficking in urban centres, many Aboriginal women and girls leave reserves for the city, and young Aboriginal men become involved in gangs, so trafficking prevention initiatives need to target the risk factors affecting Aboriginal communities on reserves as well as urban centres. Aboriginal girls and women are likely to be over-represented among each of the at-risk groups discussed below. In the western provinces, anecdotal reports indicated that domestic trafficking and sexual exploitation predominantly affect Aboriginal women and girls.

### 9.2 Children and youth at risk – trafficking and other related sexual exploitation

Risks of sexual exploitation may be related to family members or friends, when they are in the child welfare system, or leaving care, when they run away from home and live on the street, when they become involved in youth gangs, or are in conflict with the law. These youth frequently face several of these risk factors, making them vulnerable to grooming, often by “boyfriends” which begins with promises of affection and support and may lead to forced prostitution. In their report on the sexual exploitation of children in Canada, the *Senate Standing Committee on Human Rights* references the lack of social and community support, addiction to drugs or alcohol, mental illness, disability and poor health – all factors exacerbating the risk for certain sub-populations of children and youth.\textsuperscript{48} Girls and young women especially are at risk of luring through the Internet for sexual exploitation purposes. Further, the report argues that such exploitation is deeply rooted in many Canadian homes.\textsuperscript{49} The report points out that while the age of consent for sexual activity in Canada is 16, “… the age of consent is 18 years of age where the sexual activity exploits the young person – when it involves prostitution, pornography or occurs in a relationship of authority, trust or dependency.”\textsuperscript{50}

\textsuperscript{48} Standing Senate Committee on Human Rights (November 2011). *The Sexual Exploitation of Children in Canada: the Need for National Action*.
\textsuperscript{49} Senate Standing Committee on Human Rights (November 2011). *The Sexual Exploitation of Children in Canada: the Need for National Action*.
\textsuperscript{50} Department of Justice (modified December 1, 2011). *Age of Consent to Sexual Activity*. http://www.justice.gc.ca/eng/rp-pr/other-autre/clp/faq.html
Commercial sexual exploitation of children is prohibited under the Palermo Trafficking Protocol. Canada is also responsible to protect children from harm and to advance their rights under the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC), as well as under other Canadian federal and some provincial legislation.

*The Manitoba Sexual Exploitation Strategy – Tracia’s Trust – defines child sexual exploitation as: the act of coercing, luring or engaging a child, under the age of 18, into a sexual act, and involvement in the sex trade or pornography, with or without the child’s consent, in exchange for money, drugs, shelter, food, protection or other necessities.*

While the majority of those who end up in the sex trade in Canada are girls, boys are also at risk. The Senate Report notes that boys under the age of 14 are at risk of sexual exploitation by family members. Further, a series of studies of young male prostitutes in Canada’s western provinces indicated that some 88% of them had run away from home before becoming involved in the sex trade, 55% were in care, and 75% had been sexually exploited before their entry into the sex trade.

**Children and youth – violence in the family**

A recent Statistics Canada study on family violence, based on police-reported data for 2009, indicates that:

- Children and youth under the age of 18 were most likely to be sexually victimized or physically assaulted by someone they knew (85% of incidents).
- Nearly 55,000 children and youth were reported to be victims of sexual or physical assault in 2009, about 3 in 10 of which were perpetrated by a family member.
- Six in ten children and youth victims of family violence were assaulted by their parents. The youngest child victims (under the age of three) were most vulnerable to violence by a parent.
- The rate of reported family-related sexual offences was more than four times higher for girls than for boys, although the rate of physical assault was similar for girls and boys.

Even if they are not victims themselves, children growing up in homes where there is physical violence are known to be affected by witnessing it. They may accept it as normal, or learn to pattern their own behaviour on violence. The General Social Survey on Victimisation has estimated that children in an estimated 461,000 households heard or saw one parent assaulting the other in 1999. Apart from the links between sexual and physical violence and subsequent exploitation, family members may also be involved in encouraging exploitation. Some Aboriginal girls may be forced into prostitution by relatives including parents, siblings, aunts and uncles, especially if a family member is involved in a gang.

---

51 Article 35: ‘States Parties shall take all appropriate national, bilateral and multilateral measures to prevent the abduction of, the sale of or traffic in children for any purpose or in any form.’


Questions to consider for your city/catchment area

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Children and youth at risk – violence in the family</th>
<th>Key sources/contacts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• How many children and youth are ‘at risk’ because of their home situation?</td>
<td>• Local and provincial child and family departments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Are there effective systems for identifying boys and girls and young men and women at risk?</td>
<td>• Local children’s hospitals/health clinics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• What are the home circumstances that put them ‘at risk’?</td>
<td>• Local and provincial police data</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Which neighbourhoods have disproportionate numbers of girls and boys, young women and young men ‘at risk’?</td>
<td>• Children’s Aid Societies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Are the problems associated with specific demographic groups?</td>
<td>• Statistics Canada</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Which services and programmes are addressing the problems?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Are there any specific services which address risk of sexual exploitation for these children?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• What additional supports or services are required?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Is there good multi-agency co-operation on this issue?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• What are the priorities for further action?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Children and youth growing up in care and leaving care

Estimates of the numbers of children in ‘out of home’ care (child protection, group homes or foster care) across Canada vary, because of differences in child welfare legislation and systems between provinces and territories. Some 65,000 cases were reported in 2007. More recent estimates by the Child Welfare League of Canada suggest 76,000 to 85,000 children are in foster care across the country. Rates of care appear to be increasing across Canada, and it has been suggested that the number of families willing to foster children has been declining.

The primary reasons why children and youth are taken into care are physical or sexual abuse, neglect, emotional maltreatment, and exposure to intimate partner violence. This means that children who come under the care of child welfare systems have already been exposed to a number of risk factors.

The First Nations Child and Family Caring Society (FNCFCS, 2005) estimates that 30–40% of children in care are Aboriginal. In some provinces Aboriginal children comprise 70% to 85% of children in care.

For Aboriginal children, rates are much higher, with 1 in 10 compared with 1 in 200 non-Aboriginal children likely to be in care at some point in their lives. As the Native Women’s Association of Canada (NWAC) has argued, violence within Aboriginal families has become both intergenerational and normalized. Nevertheless, a main reason that Aboriginal children come to the attention of child welfare services is often for neglect, not violence.

---

Once in care, a number of children who experience difficulties in foster or group homes may develop risky or deviant behaviour including the use of alcohol and drugs and minor offending, leading to entry into the criminal justice system, or becoming ‘chronic runaways’. 59 A major concern is what happens to children when they leave care. They will be at even greater risk of being victimized or becoming an offender upon exiting care if there are no family and community supports in place, or they have no viable employment or job skills. In Ontario some 8,300 children are in foster care, and the problems confronting youth leaving care were the topic of public hearings with the Advocate for Children and Youth in 2012.60 Again, the age of protection for children and youth in care varies across the provinces and territories (see box).

Research on young people leaving care indicates that, compared to their peers, they are more likely to: 61

- Leave school before completing their secondary education;
- Become a parent at a young age;
- Be dependent on social assistance;
- Be unemployed or underemployed;
- Be incarcerated/involved with the criminal justice system;
- Experience homelessness;
- Have mental health problems;
- Be at higher risk for substance abuse problems.

Youth leaving care, therefore, face many considerable challenges. “They bear the scars of physical and emotional trauma, yet are expected to function independently, usually with little social or financial support, once they reach the age of 18.”62

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions to consider for your city/catchment area</th>
<th>Key sources/contacts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Children and youth growing up in care and leaving care</td>
<td>Provincial/Territorial Ministry responsible for Child Welfare/Protection</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• How many young people are growing up in care?  What are the gender and diversity profiles?  How many leave care each year, and at what age?  What is their demographic profile?  What is the level of education and job skills for youth leaving care?  How many youth in care experienced previous victimization?  How many youth in care are believed to be involved in sexually exploitative activity?  What specific supports are provided to prevent future exploitation?  How many youth exiting care could be at high risk of being sexually exploited?  What are the main risk factors and concerns confronting youth leaving care?  What services support youth leaving care?  What other service initiatives are required?  What are the priorities for further action?</td>
<td>Children’s Aid Society  National Youth in Care Network  Provincial Advocate for Children and Youth</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

62 Ibid.
Street/homeless children and youth

Thousands of children run away from parental or foster homes each year in Canada and end up living on the street. Police departments suggest that 90% of runaway children return home within 60 days of leaving, but the others never go back. Those who have run away from, or in some cases been forced out of their homes, account for only a portion of the homeless youth population. The latter also includes young people living in shelters for the homeless with a mother or both parents. An estimated 65,000 youth were homeless or living in homeless shelters in 2004. Street or homeless youth range in age from around 12 to 24 years of age. In a three-city (St. John’s, Calgary, and Toronto) snapshot study of homeless youth, 68% came from care situations, 62% had dropped out of school, and 73% were unemployed. Over half reported drug and alcohol abuse, often as a way to cope with living on the street, and a quarter reported previous sexual, physical or emotional abuse. Most of these homeless youth found support in the street culture among them. Given their lifestyle and drug involvement, homeless youth are also vulnerable to health problems including HIV/AIDS.

A Public Health Agency of Canada study, Street Youth in Canada, reports that:

Several studies have noted that street youth use various survival strategies such as staying with friends, trading sex or prostitution, and committing offences when living on the streets. The longer they live on the street, the more likely they are to use these strategies. It has been estimated that between 12% and 32% of Canadian street youth are involved in prostitution…Limited education, a lack of marketable job skills and the generalized emotional and cognitive instability associated with homelessness itself contribute to these youths’ dependency on the ‘street economy” (e.g. sex trade, panhandling, drug running) as their primary source of income to meet their basic needs for food, clothing and shelter.

The key triggers for young people leaving home would appear to be:

- Family-related factors (ranging from poverty to abuse);
- System-related factors (including children in justice and mental health institutions, in care, or not receiving any form of support);
- Illiteracy, leaving school early;
- Lack of access to basic services.

---

63 Raising the Roof (2009). Youth Homelessness in Canada: The Road to Solutions. www.raisingtheroof.org
64 Ibid.
### Questions to consider for your city/catchment area

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Street/Homeless Children</th>
<th>Key sources/contacts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• What is the population of street children and youth? What are the gender and diversity profiles of homeless boys and girls?</td>
<td>• Local police data</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• What is their demographic profile?</td>
<td>• Community/NGO’s</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Where do they sleep and work? Differences by gender, age?</td>
<td>• Outreach workers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Are the numbers increasing?</td>
<td>• Child and Family Services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Why are they ‘on the street’ and how do they survive?</td>
<td>• Youth in Care Network</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• What is their involvement in sexual exploitation – as victims or perpetrators?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Which activities bring them into conflict with the law?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Is there a multi-sector policy on street children?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Which services or organizations are engaged with them?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• How well are interventions working, what else is needed to prevent sexual exploitation?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• What are the priorities for further action?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Children and youth involved in gangs

Youth or street gangs in Canada are usually distinguished from organized criminal groups. They can be classified into three types: self-identified groups, those recognized by others as a distinct group, and groups engaged in a significant amount of deviant and law-breaking behaviour that has come to the attention of the police.  

In 2007, the Criminal Intelligence Service Canada (CISC) estimated there were 900 organized crime groups across the country including approximately 300 street gangs. The ethnic and cultural backgrounds of gang members vary. Some research suggests that youth gang members come from many ethnic, geographic, demographic and socio-economic backgrounds. Overall, youth at risk of joining or already involved in gangs tend to come from backgrounds of inequality and social disadvantage. By the time they join, most gang members have already become involved in illegal drug use, crime and violence or dropped out of school. In Western Canada, Aboriginal youth are at higher risk of being recruited into a gang compared to non-Aboriginal youth. One study suggests that 22% of all gang members in Canada are Aboriginal, with some 800-1000 members in the Prairies alone. 

The link between sexual exploitation, trafficking and youth gangs is very evident in the case of domestic trafficking, and relates to gang activity in the Atlantic Provinces, Quebec, Ontario and Western Canada. CISC estimates that the profits derived from prostitution by organized criminal networks in Canada range from $300 to $1,500 a day per person, so there are clearly huge incentives to engage in trafficking and related exploitation.

---

The activities of gang members in your city and surrounding area should be taken into account in forming an overall strategy to prevent trafficking and exploitation. This should also include initiatives focused on youth gang members in custody and on their return to the community. Rehabilitation programmes can help to prevent their return to trafficking and exploitation.

### Questions to consider for your city/catchment area

**Children and youth involved in gangs**
- How many children and youth are members of criminal gangs in your city?
- What is the demographic profile of gang members?
- How many girls are being recruited into gangs, what is their role?
- Are gangs associated with particular neighbourhoods or ethnic/cultural groups?
- What is ‘driving’ gang activity (disaffection, profit, insecurity)?
- Are the gangs linked to human trafficking or sexual exploitation?
- What is the victimization rate among gang members?
- Is a strategy in place to tackle gang-related activities?
- Which organizations are already engaged with existing gangs?
- What action is being taken to reduce recruitment of girls?
- What are the priorities for further action?

**Key sources/contacts**
- Local police data
- NGO’s/community groups
- Youth Justice

### Technology and sexual exploitation

The huge increase in cell phone technology and social networking over the past ten years has created a whole new meeting platform among children and young people and their acquaintances, but it also facilitates access to them by others.

Internet luring was prohibited in the Criminal Code in 2002 (section 172.1). Since that time, the number of incidents has increased every year with 464 incidents reported in 2006-2007. Young people are themselves, through their use of ‘sexting’ via text messaging, photographs or videos, often divulging too much personal information without being aware of the risks. As the Senate Committee reports, the Internet has become a place for children to explore their developing sexuality.

Concern about the existence of websites promoting sexual exploitation has existed for a number of years. These activities have also been facilitated by the growth of the Internet. It is important to consider the options for preventing such exploitation and increasing awareness of the risks in your municipality.

### Questions to consider for your city/catchment area

**Technology and sexual exploitation**
- How aware are people about the risks of ‘sexting’ and of child luring for sexual exploitation?
- Is the local travel and hotel industry taking steps to raise awareness?
- Are there awareness-raising campaigns in your city?
- Are there services to help parents, teachers and young people to increase awareness about Internet luring, learn about prevention, and build capacity?

**Key sources/contacts**
- Local and provincial police/RCMP
- Hotel industry
- Media Awareness Network
- Cybertip.ca

---


9.3 Women at risk – trafficking for the purposes of sexual exploitation

For women, their status as adults means that they are seen as responsible, and their involvement in prostitution or sex work or the sex industry generally is more likely to be judged a ‘choice’. It may be difficult for observers to distinguish between those forced into prostitution, those for whom it seems the only option to earn money, and those who have chosen sex work as a profession.

History of care, abuse or prior victimization

What is clear is that women with a past history as children or young women of family abuse, being in care, or in conflict with the law, are also likely to be at risk as adults of being exploited sexually. In general, the risk factors are the same, but will be exacerbated by substance abuse, homelessness, conflict with the law, and often by lack of education and employment skills.

Women involved in the sex industry

Adult women involved in the sex industry may also be at risk of domestic trafficking. Through gang involvement, they may be forced into prostitution. They may also be forced by a pimp whom they consider to be a boyfriend. In both situations, forced prostitution is trafficking. Victims from other countries are likely to include adult women recruited for fictitious jobs in the service and beauty industry or as dancers, etc. Some women who choose to migrate to Canada may similarly find themselves forced to work in the sex industry, but the numbers are difficult to estimate. In 1997 a series of raids on massage parlours in Toronto resulted in the arrest of Thai and Malaysian women who were illegal migrants recruited to work in the sex trade. Once they arrived, their passports were taken and they were forced to pay debt bonds of $30,000-$35,000 and work long hours.75

Questions to consider for your city/catchment area

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions to consider for your city/catchment area</th>
<th>Key sources/contacts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Women involved in the sex industry</strong></td>
<td>Surveys</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• How many women are known to be engaged in prostitution in the city/catchment area?</td>
<td>Interviews with service workers, police, hotel and transport staff</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• What is the demographic profile of these women?</td>
<td>Interviews with sex workers, immigrant community organizations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Where do they come from?</td>
<td>Local police data</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• What proportion has chosen sex work as a profession?</td>
<td>Local hospitals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• What proportion ended up in sex work because of their difficult childhoods/youth, and lack of alternatives?</td>
<td>Local health clinics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• What proportion may be victims of domestic trafficking?</td>
<td>Immigration services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• What proportion may be victims of international trafficking?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Are there increasing numbers of immigrant women working in bars, the service sector and the beauty/aesthetics industries?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• What is the profile of foreign sex workers working in the city and who are their clients?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Are the numbers increasing?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• In which areas of the city do these women work and live?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• What policies and services exist to support them?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Women who are homeless, in shelters and second stage housing

Poverty is a major causal factor for homelessness among women, often associated with low incomes or assistance rates and the absence of affordable housing. Women with children experience even greater difficulties finding affordable housing and services. Once on the street, their risk of trafficking and exploitation are increased in the absence of access to legitimate work. Violence in the home is another significant reason why women seek alternative shelter. In Canada, homeless women and those living in shelters and supportive living are likely to have experienced physical and sexual abuse as children, and/or be victims of spousal assaults as adults.

Unlike men’s, women’s homelessness is largely “invisible.” Homeless women, including those with children, are less likely to stay in shelters and more likely to stay with friends or family, or other informal arrangements. For young women, homelessness and the need for a place to stay may involve trading sex, which can lead to deeper involvement in the sex trade and into trafficking situations.

Among Aboriginal people the rates of homelessness and living in sheltered accommodation are high. In the City of Winnipeg, for example, some 8% of the population identified themselves as Aboriginal in 2001, but they represented 60-70% of the homeless population.76 In the Greater Vancouver Region, Aboriginals represent 2% of the overall population but 30% of the homeless population. Of these, 35% were women, higher than the percentage for homeless non-Aboriginal women.

Foreign students, recent immigrants, refugees, migrants

Women who are newcomers to Canada may be at risk of exploitation for a number of reasons. Being unfamiliar with Canadian social and cultural customs, not being fluent in English or French, arriving without much income or a settled and reasonably paid job, may all contribute to insecurity and vulnerability. Women who arrive as refugee claimants, for example, are unlikely to have sufficient resources to provide good shelter and daily needs. While some urban areas have a number of cultural organizations which provide support for people arriving from their region or country, they may not cater to all new immigrant families nor are they always easily found. Some of these women may end up homeless and in shelters following crises such as job losses or partner abuse. The temporary or lack of immigration status for migrants significantly increases their vulnerability to exploitation.77 Through the use of force and threats, traffickers manipulate the desire of migrants to remain in Canada permanently.

Questions to consider for your city/catchment area

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Women who are homeless or in shelters</th>
<th>Key sources/contacts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• How many homeless women, and is this increasing?</td>
<td>• Local shelters</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• What is the demographic profile of this population?</td>
<td>• NGO’s/ community agencies that work with women</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• How many women in supportive living facilities and shelters in the city? Is the number increasing?</td>
<td>• Victims Services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• What is the demographic profile of these women?</td>
<td>• Refugee and Immigrant support groups</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• What are the reasons for these women to be in shelters/supportive living?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• What other services and policies are needed to provide them with protection from exploitation?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Foreign students, recent immigrants, refugees, migrants</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• How many foreign students, recent immigrant, refugee and migrant women are living in your city?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Where do they come from?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• What are their circumstances and needs (housing, income, languages, work and training)?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• What is their risk of sexual exploitation?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• What policies and/or services exist to support them?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• What are the gaps in services, how can they be filled?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

9.4 Populations at risk – trafficking for the purposes of labour exploitation

Foreign nationals – migrant workers, foreign visitors and students, persons without immigration status

Migrant and temporary workers have been coming to Canada on a regular basis for decades. A range of temporary foreign worker programs exist which share the objectives of helping to address Canada’s labour shortages and protecting foreign national participants. Some 150,000 persons enter Canada each year to work in industry and agricultural jobs, and in private homes. The Seasonal Agricultural Worker Programme, established in 1966, brings 25,000 workers to Canada each year, for example. Seasonal workers depart each year; others enter on temporary one to two year work visas requested by their employers. The temporary status of these foreign nationals, along with the hope of many to stay in Canada permanently, may make some vulnerable to exploitative third parties and employers. For these same reasons, other foreign nationals such as students and visitors may also be vulnerable to exploitation depending on their personal circumstances, for example, their socio-economic status. Those most vulnerable, however, would be persons who do not have immigration status and consequently fear being returned to their country of origin by authorities.

The International Labour Organization has established a set of indicators for assessing whether or not people are being exploited in their work situation (see box). In Canada, regulations governing temporary workers vary between the provinces and territories. Manitoba has recently increased its regulations and inspection to prevent foreign worker labour exploitation. Nevertheless, many temporary workers are still vulnerable to exploitation by employers, and often unaware of their rights or where to obtain advice. Live-in caregivers, many of whom come from the Philippines, often work in private homes where pay, hours and conditions are harder to regulate than on industrial or agricultural sites.

---

Examples include the Live-In Caregiver Program and the Seasonal Agricultural Worker Program.
**International Labour Organization (ILO)**

**Indicators of trafficking of adults for labour exploitation**

**Strong indicators of exploitation:**

- Excessive working days or hours, including the concept of forced overtime, being denied breaks and free time, being on call 24 hours a day, seven days a week, and being subjected to a heavy and excessive workload vis-à-vis the working hours.

**Medium indicators of exploitation:**

- Bad living conditions as indicated by a lack of freedom of choice as to the location or living conditions, being forced to live in overcrowded, unhealthy, unsanitary conditions, or where there is limited or no privacy.
- Hazardous work, which can relate to the nature of the task or the hazardous working environment, such as extreme heat or cold, and can also comprise degrading, humiliating, and dirty work.
- No respect of labour laws or contract including cases where the victim was forced to work without or under an unlawful contract, where the contract was not respected or where there was deception about the nature of the job, the employer, or the possibility to work.
- No social protection as indicated by the denial of social insurance and sick leave as well as being forced to work during pregnancy.
- Low or no salary and wage manipulation which include cases where the individual receives “goods”/“in-kind” payment.
- Very bad working conditions.

The RCMP has suggested that both the *Live-in Caregiver Programme* and the *Seasonal Agricultural Worker Programme* are open to exploitation and abuse by traffickers, and additional safeguards to address this are set out in the National Action Plan. Labour exploitation is strongly associated with specific places of risk including schools and malls for young girls, transport hubs, border areas, certain industries, and remote and rural areas. In Canada, there are remote and rural male-dominated centres such as logging and mining or natural resource exploitation sites, and agricultural areas, which present specific challenges especially for women working in these remote settings, often in service sectors.

**Questions to consider for your city/catchment area**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Foreign nationals – migrant workers, foreign students, persons without immigration status</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• How many migrants/temporary foreign workers, foreign students and persons without immigration status are living in the city?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• What industries, jobs are they working in?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• What educational institutions are they attending?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Are the numbers increasing?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• What is the background and demographic profile of this population?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• What are their working conditions and pay?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Are they aware of their rights, do they have any supports and services?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• What services and policies are needed to provide them with greater protection from exploitation?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Key sources/contacts**

- Labour offices
- Citizenship and Immigration Canada
- NGO’s/community agencies working temporary workers
- Victims Services
- Refugee and immigrant support groups

---


10. Addressing demand

Policies to prevent trafficking and other related forms of exploitation need to confront the issue of the demand for services. The demand side of human trafficking is often neglected in favour of support to victims and prosecution of traffickers. Yet demand is at the root of trafficking and related forms of exploitation since the greater the demand, the greater the profits for the exploiters. Those involved in trafficking and exploitation include a number of groups: those who are knowingly involved; those who enable it to take place by turning a ‘blind eye’ or failing to regulate activities, and those who directly use the services of trafficked victims. In other words, populations involved in the demand and supply of trafficking range from street gangs, pimps, commercial bars, salons, hotel owners/staff to “Johns” and clients of strip clubs, escort agencies and massage parlours, and from purchasers of goods produced through forced labour to private employers and third parties.

In developing the broad city profile, the safety audit should have provided a greater understanding of the types of industries or businesses involved in trafficking for forced labour or sexual exploitation in your city, and the general location of activity. Further research, interviews and surveys may help to assess the extent of knowledge and awareness about trafficking in target industries and places.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions to consider for your city/catchment area</th>
<th>Key sources/contacts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **Traffickers, enablers, users – sexual exploitation** | • Police  
• Labour offices  
• NGO’s/ community agencies working temporary workers  
• Victims Services  
• Refugee and immigrant support groups  
• Third party agencies |
| • What is known about the traffickers in your city and catchment area?  
• What industries exist within your city that may use or enable sexual exploitation and where are they located?  
• Are there any third party agencies recruiting workers in your city/Province?  
• Who are the enablers/observers of sexual exploitation?  
• How many Johns are there in your city?  
• How big is the problem?  
• What services or programs exist that are targeting the demand side of sexual exploitation?  
• What is their background and demographic profile of this population?  
• What services and policies are needed to reduce demand? |  
| **Traffickers, Enablers, Users – Labour Exploitation** |  
| • What is known about people exploiting labour in your city and catchment area?  
• What industries may use or enable labour exploitation?  
• Who are the enablers/observers of labour exploitation?  
• How big is the problem?  
• What services or programs are targeting the demand side of labour exploitation?  
• Are there any codes of ethics for companies?  
• Do local companies monitor their supply chain? |
Annexes

Annex A: Glossary of Terms (alphabetical order)

Child sexual exploitation involves the act of coercing, luring or engaging a child who is under the age of eighteen, into a sexual act, and involvement in the sex trade or pornography, with or without the child’s consent, in exchange for money, drugs, shelter, food, protection or other necessities.

Demand refers to the need for inexpensive labour where markets can be satisfied through illegal migration, smuggling of migrants and trafficking in people from outside and within a country. This is increased by the existence of unregulated labour sectors, such as domestic work and the sex industry, which do not allow the intervention of labour authorities.

Diversity refers to the conditions, expressions and experiences of different groups such as age, culture, ethnicity, education, gender, disability, sexual orientation, migration status, geography, language and religious beliefs.

Disaggregated data refers to the data broken down by age, race, ethnicity, income, education, etc. This is sometimes referred to as gender-disaggregated data.

Forced or compulsory labour: ‘all work or service which is exacted from any person under the menace of any penalty and for which the said person has not offered himself voluntarily.’ ILO Forced Labour Convention, 1930 C29.

Gender refers to the socially constructed roles and relationships, personality traits, attitudes, behaviours, values, relative power and influence that a particular society considers appropriate for men and women.

Gender-based analysis (GBA) is a method for examining a policy, program or initiative for its varying impacts on diverse groups of women and men, girls and boys.

Migrant refers to a person who is engaged or has been engaged in a remunerated activity in a country of which he or she is not a national. (definition from United Nations Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families)
Push and pull factors are inter-related and contribute to trafficking in persons. “Push” factors include extreme poverty, unemployment, lack of education, inadequate social programs, gender-based inequality, war and conflict situations, and political unrest in countries of origin. “Pull” factors include a globalized, free-market economy that has increased the demand for cheap labour, goods and services in many countries. Victims may also be “pulled” into trafficking through the promise of money and what is seen as a better life.

Smuggling, often confused with human trafficking, involves the procurement of an illegal entry into another country for the purpose of financial or material benefit. Persons who have been smuggled may pay large sums of money and may enter a country clandestinely, or through deception, such as the use of fraudulent documents. Unlike trafficking victims, the smuggled person usually consents to be smuggled. The relationship between the smuggler and the smuggled person is a voluntary business transaction which usually ends after the border crossing. Smuggled migrants may become victims of trafficking which may make it difficult to distinguish between smuggling and trafficking.

Trafficking in persons or human trafficking, as the terms are interchangeable, is defined in the UN Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children as the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of the position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purposes of exploitation. Exploitation shall include, at a minimum, the exploitation of the prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labour or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs. Said another way, trafficking has the following components:

- **The Act (What is done)**: Recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons;
- **The Means (How it is done)**: Threat or use of force, coercion, abduction, fraud, deception, abuse of power or vulnerability, or giving payments or benefits to a person in control of the victim; and
- **The Purpose (Why it is done)**: For the purpose of exploitation, this includes exploiting the prostitution of others, sexual exploitation, forced labour, slavery or similar practices and the removal of organs.
Annex B: International laws and guidelines relevant to prevention of trafficking and other related exploitation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Instrument</th>
<th>Relevant sections</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>General</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings (Council of Europe, 2005) <a href="http://conventions.coe.int/Treaty/EN/Treaties/Html/197.htm">http://conventions.coe.int/Treaty/EN/Treaties/Html/197.htm</a></td>
<td>Articles 1, 2, 5, 6, 7, 10, 29, and 32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Children</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Convention Concerning the Prohibition and Immediate Action for the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour (International Labour Organization 1999) <a href="http://www.ilo.org/iolex/cgi-lex/convde.pl?C182">http://www.ilo.org/iolex/cgi-lex/convde.pl?C182</a></td>
<td>Articles 1, 6, and 7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Women</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accelerating Efforts to Eliminate All Forms of Violence Against Women: Ensuring Due Diligence in Prevention (United Nations, 2010) <a href="http://www.unhchr.org/refworld/publisher,UNHRC,,4c2b155f2,0.html">http://www.unhchr.org/refworld/publisher,UNHRC,,4c2b155f2,0.html</a></td>
<td>Sections 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 12, 18, and 19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Declaration on the Elimination of Violence against Women (United Nation 1994) <a href="http://www.unhchr.ch/huridocda/huridoca.nsf/(symbol)/a.res.48.104.en">http://www.unhchr.ch/huridocda/huridoca.nsf/(symbol)/a.res.48.104.en</a></td>
<td>P.P. 5, 6, 7, 12, and Article 4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Annex C: Canadian examples of prevention practices

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Practice</th>
<th>Sexual Exploitation</th>
<th>Labour Exploitation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Legislation</strong></td>
<td>Province legislation</td>
<td>Province legislation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Governance</strong></td>
<td>Governance and Community Services</td>
<td>Governance and Community Services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Establish permanent local task force or forum; mechanisms to coordinate information and action</td>
<td>BC Office to Combat Trafficking (OCTIP)</td>
<td>Governance and Community Services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Manitoba Human Trafficking Interdepartmental Committee</td>
<td>Governance and Community Services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Tracia’s Trust Sexual Exploitation Strategy</td>
<td>Governance and Community Services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Situational Prevention</strong></td>
<td>Situational Prevention and awareness raising</td>
<td>Situational Prevention and awareness raising</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local regulations and enforcement</td>
<td>Niagara Regulation of body rub parlors</td>
<td>Regulation of workplace and employment situations; inspection and enforcement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local protocols</td>
<td>Manitoba Code of Conducts with business, hotel and travel associations</td>
<td>Governance and Community Services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Patrolling and surveillance of hot spots</td>
<td>Manitoba Citizen patrols; suspect tracking forms</td>
<td>Governance and Community Services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>General Awareness Raising</strong></td>
<td>General Awareness Raising and training</td>
<td>General Awareness Raising and training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public education and awareness raising</td>
<td>RCMP &quot;I'm Not for Sale&quot; campaign</td>
<td>Governance and Community Services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Crime Stoppers &quot;Blue Blindfold&quot; campaign</td>
<td>Governance and Community Services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Manitoba Hotel Association and Child Protection Services Campaign: “Stop Sex with Kids”</td>
<td>Governance and Community Services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>User awareness campaigns</td>
<td>Manitoba &quot;Dear John: It's rape not a date&quot; campaign</td>
<td>Governance and Community Services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hotlines and public numbers for reporting, advice and help</td>
<td>Manitoba 24-7 Crisis Hotline</td>
<td>Governance and Community Services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Internet awareness</td>
<td>Manitoba Cybertip.ca; Media Aware Network</td>
<td>Governance and Community Services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Canadian Centre for Child Protection &quot;The Door is not Locked; ‘Zoe and Molly’</td>
<td>Governance and Community Services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education and awareness raising</td>
<td>Public Safety and PACT Ottawa TruckSTOP campaign</td>
<td>Governance and Community Services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Manitoba Girl-to Girl and Boy to Boy</td>
<td>Governance and Community Services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>BC e-learning curriculum</td>
<td>Governance and Community Services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Montreal Cinderella’s Silence (Centre de Jeunesse)</td>
<td>Governance and Community Services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Targeted Awareness Raising</strong></td>
<td>Targeted Awareness Raising and training</td>
<td>Targeted Awareness Raising and training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local campaigns</td>
<td>Inclusive projects which support at risk populations, invite discussions with business sector, alert residents to how they can help</td>
<td>Targeted Awareness Raising and training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Community and Neighbourhood Prevention</strong></td>
<td>Projects to provide support and services</td>
<td>Community and Neighbourhood Prevention</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Projects to provide support and services</td>
<td>Montreal Street mediators</td>
<td>Projects to support migrant workers, local agricultural workers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Manitoba Street Connections and Street Reach</td>
<td>Projects to support migrant workers, local agricultural workers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ma Mawi Wi Chi Itata Centre; Experiential worker training</td>
<td>Projects to support migrant workers, local agricultural workers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Interventions</strong></td>
<td>Interventions with high risk groups, reintegration for post care or custody groups</td>
<td>Interventions with high risk groups, reintegration for post care or custody groups</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Manitoba Transition, Education and Resources for Females (TERF) transition out of the sex trade</td>
<td>Interventions with high risk groups, reintegration for post care or custody groups</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>